# The Economics of Best Practice Implementation

Laura Fay

January 21, 2025

WSSC Salt Summit



### Winter Maintenance Best Management Practices

• Operations









Western Transportation Institute

# Winter Maintenance Best Management Practices

- Maintenance
- Calibration





# What is your motivation?



### Regulation



### Sustainability





### The Triple Bottom Line





Transportation Institute

### Where do I start?

- Assess your operations
- When you look, you can find opportunities for improvements everywhere.
- Look to your staff for suggestions.
- Start with the low hanging fruit!
  - Doing a lot with a little...
    - Equipment Calibration
    - Plow speed
    - Variable application rates
    - Collect and analyze your data





The Economics of achieving the triple bottom line with BMPs.... Real world examples

- The power of CALIBRATION
- Asked the drivers where they set the knob 500 1200 lbs/l-m
- Recommended application rate is 250 lbs/l-m.
- Once calibrated, changing the culture of the operators became apparent.
- \$75,000 savings in one year

### **Resources**

- Winter Spreader Calibration (Iowa DOT) <u>https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=IJmpblRgdy8</u>
- Local Government Snowplow Salt and Sand Controller Calibration Guide -<u>https://mdl.mndot.gov/items/2009RIC08</u>



# Plow speed study (Michigan DOT, 2012)

Dry





Pre-wet





• 25 mph, Salt on Road (12ft lane)

- Dry 90-95%
- Pre-wet 100%

- 45 mph, Salt on Road (12ft lane)
  - Dry 65% [30% LOSS]
  - Pre-wet 74% [25% LOSS]



Western Transportation Institute

### Variable Application Rates

|                           | F                               |                          |                          |                          |                  |                   |
|---------------------------|---------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|------------------|-------------------|
| Storm Type                | Above 32°F<br>and constant      | Above 32°F and dropping  | 20°- 32°F                | 5°- 20°F                 | Below 5°F        | Utah DOT          |
| Light Snow                | Apply nothing<br>– just monitor | 100-150<br>Ibs/lane mile | 100-150<br>lbs/lane mile | 150-250<br>lbs/lane mile | Apply no<br>salt | 100 – 500 lbs/l-m |
| Light to Moderate<br>Snow | Apply nothing<br>– just monitor | 100-200<br>Ibs/lane mile | 200-250<br>lbs/lane mile | 250-350<br>lbs/lane mile | Apply no<br>salt |                   |
| Moderate to<br>Heavy Snow | Apply nothing<br>– just monitor | 100-150<br>Ibs/lane mile | 200-250<br>lbs/lane mile | 250-500<br>lbs/lane mile | Apply no<br>salt |                   |
| Freezing Rain             | Apply nothing<br>– just monitor | 75-100 lbs/lane<br>mile  | 150-300<br>lbs/lane mile | 250-500<br>lbs/lane mile | Apply no<br>salt |                   |

Pounds per lane mile of prewetted salt.

Assuming: 12-foot lane, 2-hour turn-around, medium service level

|                   | Surface<br>Temperature (F): | Heavy Frost,<br>Light Snow | Medium<br>snow | Heavy Snow | Freezing<br>rain, drizzle,<br>sleet | Blowing Snow  | Notes  |
|-------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|----------------|------------|-------------------------------------|---|--|
| Iowa DOT          | 33-27 F                     | 100                        | 125            | 150        | 200                                 | At all temperatures: Plow<br>only if pavement remains<br>dry. If icy<br>wheeltracks/patches<br>develop, use brine alone or<br>with salt and follow-up<br>frequently with additional<br>plowing/brine/salt until<br>pavements dry or blowing<br>stops. | If pavements are already wet before pavement<br>temperatures cool below 33, rates may be increased<br>for first two hours after storm start to prevent bonding.  |
| 100 – 300 lbs/l-m | 26-21 F                     | 125                        | 150            | 200        | 250                                 |   | Rates may be lowered after initial round   |
| Western           | 20-5 F                      | 150                        | 175            | 250        | 300 prewet<br>50/50                 |   | Plow only if snow is not sticking. Apply salt below 15F<br>only when conditions are favorable to avoid salt<br>waste or refreeze. If icing occurs below 5F, use<br>prewet sand at 20 gal/Im and 250 lbs. |



For reference: 1 gallon brine = 2.2 lbs salt. 5 gal/LM = 11 lbs, 10 gal/LM = 22 lbs, 40 gal/LM = 88 lbs



Transportation Institute

### Collect and Analyze your Data

- What data is your agency collecting?
- How are you using this data?





# Collect and Analyze your Data





Western Transportation Institute

### When more is required to realize benefits

- You have tackled the low hanging fruit, no what?
- Make targeted financial investments in equipment and training
- Consider programmatic changes



Transportation Institute

### Larger Investments or Programmatic Changes

### • Example – Adding liquids to your operations





# When more is required to realize benefits

- Come up with a Plan
- Start Small
- Give it a trial run, test it
- Tweak it to fit your needs
- Reassess costs and requirements compared to benefits
- You can always grow the program if its working





Transportation Institute

The Economics of achieving the triple bottom line with BMPs.... Real world examples

- DOTs Partnering with Conservation Organizations
  - Why: Elevated chloride levels identified at wastewater treatment facility
  - What: Developed trainings for parking lots and local road organizations
  - Best Practices Implemented:
    - Anti-icing and pre-wetting
    - Calibration
    - Using pavement temperature data to make decisions
    - Reduced plow speeds during applications
  - Economic Improvement: 40% reduction in chloride use each storm
    - 5-year avg. salt price per ton (IL): \$70.61



Western Transportation Institute

### Your path forward

- Talk to others to see what is working for them
- Attend a conference, make connections
- Send staff to trainings, conferences
- Talk to vendors





Transportation Institute